

**From:** Joan Schafer/R3/USEPA/US  
**Sent:** 1/30/2012 6:42:49 AM  
**To:** Ron Borsellino/R3/USEPA/US@EPA  
**CC:** Dennis Carney/R3/USEPA/US@EPA; Duteau.Helen@epamail.epa.gov; Kathy Hodgkiss/R3/USEPA/US@EPA; Michael Kulik/R3/USEPA/US; Shawn Garvin/R3/USEPA/US@EPA; Walter Wilkie/R3/USEPA/US@EPA  
**Subject:** Re: Scranton Times-Tribune (1-28) In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

We heard about this letter for the first time on Thursday when Terri rec'd an inquiry from a reporter who claimed the following (which we shared with Jennie so she would have a heads-up-- I don't believe OSCR has rec'd this letter yet although they have rec'd the letter to the Adm from Cabot as a control):

And a local pro-gas drilling group called "Enough is Enough" wrote a letter to Administrator Jackson this week: "The Philadelphia Regional Office's action in enabling this litigation threatens our livelihoods and is destroying our community reputation. Worse, EPA is relying upon hyped-up allegations regarding arsenic, manganese and sodium, all of which are known to be naturally occurring in our water supplies in Northeastern Pennsylvania. Even more outrageous is the twisting of EPA's Superfund authority, intended to help clean up abandoned hazardous waste sites, into a weapon for use by trial lawyers in bludgeoning Cabot for what is a non-issue. These actions are an assault on our property rights and basic freedoms. We urge you to rein in this rogue Regional Office."

Joan Schafer  
Senior Communications Specialist  
Office of Public Affairs  
USEPA - Region 3  
1650 Arch Street  
Philadelphia, PA 19103  
Phone: (215) 814-5143  
Fax: (215) 814-5102  
e-mail: schaffer.joan@epa.gov

**From:** Ron Borsellino/R3/USEPA/US  
**To:** Dennis Carney/R3/USEPA/US@EPA, Shawn Garvin/R3/USEPA/US@EPA  
**Cc:** Kathy Hodgkiss/R3/USEPA/US, "Helen Duteau" <Duteau.Helen@epamail.epa.gov>, Walter Wilkie/R3/USEPA/US, Michael Kulik/R3/USEPA/US, Joan Schafer/R3/USEPA/US  
**Date:** 01/28/2012 01:15 PM  
**Subject:** Re: Scranton Times-Tribune (1-28) In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

Shawn: never heard of letter - expect if the sent it we'll see it Monday  
Sent by EPA Wireless E-Mail Services

----- Original Message -----

**From:** Dennis Carney  
**Sent:** 01/28/2012 01:05 PM EST  
**To:** Shawn Garvin  
**Cc:** "Ron Borsellino" <borsellino.ron@epa.gov>  
**Subject:** Re: Scranton Times-Tribune (1-28) In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

**Ex. 5 - Deliberative**

----- Original Message -----

**From:** Shawn Garvin

**Sent:** 01/28/2012 12:25 PM EST

**To:** Dennis Carney; Ron Borsellino; Kathy Hodgkiss; William Early; Bob Sussman; Mathy Stanislaus; Betsaida Alcantara; Jennie Saxe; Cecil Rodrigues

**Cc:** Daniel Ryan; "Dandrea Michael" <dandrea.michael@epa.gov>; Amy Johansen; Janice Donlon; "Jerry Heston" <heston.gerald@epa.gov>

**Subject:** Re: Scranton Times-Tribune (1-28) In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

Dennis - Thanks. I knew we were moving more towards 55 based on responses, but was not aware of the additional surveys. Maybe I missed it along the way.

Shawn

----- Original Message -----

**From:** Dennis Carney

**Sent:** 01/28/2012 10:58 AM EST

**To:** Shawn Garvin; Ron Borsellino; Kathy Hodgkiss; William Early; Bob Sussman; Mathy Stanislaus; Betsaida Alcantara; Jennie Saxe; Cecil Rodrigues

**Cc:** Daniel Ryan; "Mike D'Andrea" <dandrea.michael@epa.gov>; Amy Johansen; Janice Donlon; "Jerry Heston" <heston.gerald@epa.gov>

**Subject:** Re: Scranton Times-Tribune (1-28) In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

Shawn, the action memo actually uses the phase approximately 61 homes. This was because we knew there were a few more homes in the area but we had not yet surveyed them. Now that we are back working in the community we have surveyed the final few homes. In fact 4 of the additional homes are ones where sampling was at one time performed by Cabot and/or PADEP. Thanks, Dennis.

----- Original Message -----

**From:** Shawn Garvin

**Sent:** 01/28/2012 10:21 AM EST

**To:** Ron Borsellino; Kathy Hodgkiss; Dennis Carney; William Early; Bob Sussman; Mathy Stanislaus; Betsaida Alcantara; Jennie Saxe; Cecil Rodrigues

**Cc:** Daniel Ryan; "Dandrea Michael" <dandrea.michael@epa.gov>; Amy Johansen; Janice Donlon

**Subject:** Fw: Scranton Times-Tribune (1-28) In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

Has anyone seen the letter referred to in the article from some residents to the Administrator? Also, where did the 66 home number come from? Thanks

----- Original Message -----

**From:** Roy Seneca

**Sent:** 01/28/2012 08:01 AM EST

**To:** schaffer.joan@epa.gov; white.terri-a@epa.gov; Michael Kulik; Ron Borsellino; Shawn Garvin; William Early; Daniel Ryan; Michael Dandrea; Kathy Hodgkiss; Dennis Carney; Gerald Heston; Richard Fetzer; Richard Rupert; Helen Duteau; Trish Taylor; Alexander Mandell; Jennie Saxe; Stacie Driscoll; David Sternberg; Cecil Rodrigues; Heather Gray; Humane Zia; Walter Wilkie; Lora Werner; Jon Capacasa; KarenD Johnson; Victoria Binetti; Thomas Damm; Bonnie Smith; William Smith; Jessica Greathouse; Dawn Ioven; JohnJ Butler

**Subject:** Scranton Times-Tribune (1-28) In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

In Dimock, EPA testing draws mixed reaction

By LAURA LEGERE

DIMOCK TWP. - Two teams of scientists sampling well water from four homes a day are producing a picture of the aquifer

under this Susquehanna County town that will help define the impact of natural gas drilling on drinking water.

The water captured in vials and packed in coolers by scientists and contractors for the Environmental Protection Agency since Jan. 23 is the heart of an investigation spurred by concerns that Cabot Oil & Gas Corp.'s Marcellus Shale drilling and hydraulic fracturing tainted water wells.

In a divided village where gas drilling is as earnestly embraced as it is criticized, the controversy over the EPA's fieldwork started before the sampling did. Test results are at least five weeks away.

The study has provoked strong criticism from the industry and its local supporters who accuse the EPA of meddling in what they consider a settled matter or a spectacle conjured by lawyers.

At the same time, the study has earned the grateful support of families, many of whom are suing Cabot, who have used their water warily or not at all since methane tied to drilling first intruded in 2008.

State officials determined faulty Cabot gas wells allowed methane to seep into 18 Dimock water supplies in 2009, but Cabot water tests from last fall raised federal regulators' concern about the potential health threats posed by other contaminants in the water.

The contaminants - some of which are naturally occurring but all of which are associated with natural gas drilling, the EPA said - include arsenic, barium, the plasticizer commonly called DEHP, glycol compounds, manganese, phenol and sodium.

"If we see an immediate threat to public health, we will not hesitate to take steps under the law to protect Americans whose health may be at risk," EPA spokeswoman Terri White said.

Residents who support Cabot's operations sent a letter to EPA Administrator Lisa Jackson this week calling for her to "rein in" the "rogue regional office" in Philadelphia that is leading the investigation based on what they said were "baseless claims" and "hyped-up allegations" of pollutants that occur naturally in the region.

The group, Enough is Enough, created a campaign called "Dimock Proud" with yard signs, a petition drive and a logo: "Where the water IS clean and the people are friendly."

The petition to Ms. Jackson was bundled with an earlier petition signed by more than 400 Susquehanna County residents and sent to the state to ask for Cabot to be able to resume drilling in a 9-square-mile section of Dimock - where EPA is now testing - that has been off limits to the driller since 2010. The moratorium has continued because the state has not determined that the company's wells have stopped leaking methane.

"The Philadelphia Regional Office's action in enabling this litigation threatens our livelihoods and is destroying our community reputation," the residents wrote to Ms. Jackson. "These actions are an assault on our property rights and basic freedoms."

Cabot CEO Dan Dinges cited President Barack Obama's support for domestic natural gas in his State of the Union address when he also wrote to Ms. Jackson this week. Her agency's actions in Dimock "appear to undercut the President's stated commitment to this important resource," Mr. Dinges wrote.

In another statement released this week, the company said it "is concerned that this recent action may be more of an attempt to advance a political agenda hostile to shale gas development rather than a principled effort to address environmental concerns in the area."

The industry group Energy in Depth posted historical state and federal data on its website showing some of the pollutants that triggered the EPA investigation - manganese and arsenic - occur in the geological formation that is used for groundwater in Dimock. It cited a 2006 U.S. Geological Survey study that found arsenic in 18 of 143 domestic water wells it sampled in Northeast Pennsylvania, although none of the samples taken in Susquehanna or Wyoming counties detected the compound.

The arsenic level that triggered the EPA to truck water to one home in Dimock was nearly four times the federal standard.

The EPA rebuffed Cabot's criticism this week, saying its actions "are guided entirely by science and the law."

"We are providing water to a handful of households because data developed by Cabot itself provides evidence that they are being exposed to hazardous substances at levels of health concern," the agency said. "We are conducting monitoring

as a prudent step to investigate these concerns and develop a sound scientific basis for assessing the need for further action."

While the Mr. Obama's address made clear his support for domestic natural gas extraction, the agency added, "he also affirmed our commitment to 'developing this resource without putting the health and safety of our citizens at risk.'"

Despite some residents' skepticism of the EPA's actions, the agency has received permission from 55 of the 66 Dimock homes it approached to conduct sampling, spokesman Roy Seneca said Friday. The EPA has not received a final response from 11 of the 66 homes. Its initial goal was to take samples from about 61 homes.

"I'm thrilled the EPA is here," resident Victoria Switzer said Friday as five scientists wearing blue gloves huddled on a mound of melting snow in her backyard where her well water trickled from a spigot.

If the test comes back clear, she said, "I'll be very relieved that our water is safe to use and we can go on living in our home."

The water sampling will also provide key data for the future, she said.

"I'm considering it baseline testing for the next wave when Cabot roars back in here."

Contact the writer: [llegere@timeshamrock.com](mailto:llegere@timeshamrock.com)

Read more: <http://thetimes-tribune.com/news/in-dimock-epa-testing-draws-mixed-reaction-1.1263956#ixzz1kkxdWBvA>

Roy Seneca  
EPA Region 3 Press Officer  
Office of Public Affairs  
[seneca.roy@epa.gov](mailto:seneca.roy@epa.gov)  
(215) 814-5567